

ARGUMENTATIVE ESSAY COMPONENTS: A STUDY OF ENGLISH STUDENTS' WRITING AT UIN MAHMUD YUNUS BATUSANGKAR

Elfi¹, Mukhtar Israini²

State Islamic University of Mahmud Yunus Batusangkar
*Email : elfi@uinmybatusangkar.ac.id
State Islamic University of Mahmud Yunus Batusangkar
Email : israinimuchtar@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Many students got problems in writing argumentative specially in applying to write the component of essay such as attention getter, thesis statement, pro argument, counter argument, rebuttal, and conclusion. The purpose of this research is to find out how fourth semester English students of UIN Mahmud Yunus Batusangkar applying to write the component of argumentative writing in their essay. This research used a document analysis method. The object of this research was the argumentative writing components contained in the writings made by fourth semester English Department students of UIN Mahmud Yunus Batusangkar Academic Year 2022/2023. In this research, the researcher acts as a key instrument and the mid-semester IV exam documents. To test the validity of the data, researcher used source triangulation techniques. Furthermore, in analyzing the data includes data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing which is the theory of Miles and Huberman (1994: 10-11). The finding showed that 45 students have applied to write the attention getter, thesis statement, and pro argument. 29 students have applied counter-arguments component, 13 students have applied to write rebuttal component, and 45 students have applied to write conclusion component. From the finding, writing rebuttal, counter argument and conclusion should be improve by the students in writing argumentative essay.

Keyword : *Analyzing, Component of argumentative writing, Argumentative essay*

INTRODUCTION

Learning English in college should include the four skills of speaking, listening, reading, and writing. Writing is one of the important skills in language learning, especially in college. According to Brown (2001), writing is a thinking process. Furthermore, he claimed that it can be planned and given with an unlimited number of revisions before its release. Besides, Elbow in Brown (2001) also explains that writing have two process. The first process is figuring out the meaning and the second is putting the meaning into language. Moreover, Harmer (2004) states that writing encourages students to focus on accurate language use. Writing is a productive skill for writing as well as indirect communication and

the nature of the character is very different from that expressed by speaking directly, therefore writing includes skills that require mature and critical thinking.

There are several types of writing in the study such as narrative text is a text that tells something imaginative or something that is only a delusion and its purpose is only to entertain readers (Nur Iskandar, 2013). Then descriptive text is a text that describes an object with the aim that readers feel as if they see their own object figured out. This description paragraph describes something with words clearly and in detail. Furthermore, argumentative essay is a type of essay that requires the learner's skills to investigate an idea, evaluate evidence, develop ideas, and deliver an argument that fits the topic in a way that is clear and concise. The last is persuasive text. it is a paragraph in the form of an invitation or persuading the reader to do or follow what the author expresses in the paragraph; it's called the persuasion paragraph. Several types of writing are studied, it can be understood that there are still several types of writing that can be learned, therefore the researcher explores argumentative as a topic because argumentative writing is the essence of writing articles (Reza & Athena, 2013).

Argumentative essay is one type of writing that describes writing to understand a topic, and establishes its position on the topic discussed separately (Purdue Writing Lab online [Purdue OWL], 2013). The author develops the ability to analyze something that is happening and develop it according to the rules in formulating arguments. Argumentation is a form of rhetoric that seeks to involve and involve other people, so that they believe and end up contradicting what the author wants. Through argumentation the author is able to provide the facts as a whole, so as to show whether a relationship is true or not (Keraf, 2004: 3).

Composing an argumentative essay with strong argumentation is not easy way. Argumentative essays as causal essays and comparison or contrast essays, argumentative writing seems to be the most challenging of all essay types. The author needs a claim or thesis statement then, the author must provide arguments and evidence to convince the reader.the author must also have the obligation to convey opposing views or opposing parties to claims. At the end of the essay should return the reader and reassure them.

In the process of writing an argumentative essay, some of students have difficulty in drawing up arguments. Chase (2011) observed students ' difficulty in writing argumentative essays, and found that students have difficulty in determining the components contained in such argumentative essays. Before writing an argumentative essay, students must be able to understand the components of an argumentative essay, making it easier for writers to compile a series of argumentative essays.

In college, argumentative essays are very important. Students are required to be able to express ideas in writing form. Therefore, to shape students' writing skills, especially argumentative essays, several institutions or universities have programs to hone students' abilities. At UIN Mahmud Yunus Batusangkar especially the English Department has an argumentative essay course which is taken in the fourth semester. Argumentative essay is the highest level of the type of essay studied in the English Department. The higher the level, the more students must be able to create critical thinking skill and quality of writing.

The researchers have done preliminary research and did analysis for five documents of argumentative essay project done by students. It was found that many students still got the problems in applying to write argumentative component in their essay such as attention getter, thesis statement, pro argument, counter argument, rebuttal, and conclusion. Not all of them write complete components in their essay, so that it was needed a research of document analysis to find out students application of argumentative writing component in their essay.

An argumentative essay is one of the academic writing assignments at university. The idea of argumentative essay is reviewed from various perspectives of experts such as Soles (2010), Oshima (2004), Daly (1997), Bazerman (1985). Soles (2010: 2) explains that argumentative essays are written texts in which a claimant affirms a thesis on a subject with which they disagree, provides clear evidence to support an argument or thesis, and summarizes and refutes evidence that contradicts the claim. In addition, Oshima (2004: 142) defines an argumentative essay as one in which the author argues for or against a point of view and provides evidence to back up their position. The objective is to persuade the reader that the author is correct. Additionally, this essay forces students to think independently. They have to take a position on a subject, back it up with solid reasons, and provide solid evidence to back them up. Criteria of a good argumentative essay they are statement of the issue, a statement of one's position on that issue, arguments that support one's position and rebuttals of arguments that support contrary position.

There are four types of argumentative essays: persuasive, research, analysis, and personal. Persuasive essays attempt to convince the reader that one side of an argument is superior to the other, while research papers rely on outside sources to support and make their main point. Analysis essays focus on examining the argument of another author, and personal essays do not require research to support their arguments. In a personal argumentative essay, research can still be used to strengthen the main argument, but it is necessary to take into consideration all aspects of the issue. And also Waller (2022) states three types of arguments namely classical argument, Toulmin argument and Rogerian argument.

In the essay there are several components, namely the introduction, the contents of the paragraph, and the conclusion. Based on Hyland (2018) says that the argumentative essay has three components. First the thesis, introduce the proposition to be debated. The second argument, discussing the contents of the script. The last is the conclusion, unifying the interpretation and affirming the validity of the thesis. Then Endy (2011) said that there were three components of the argumentative essay, namely the introduction (explaining the thesis, but not including evidence), the body paragraph (having several paragraphs, each having a topic sentence, specific examples by including or adding evidence to support the topic phrase), the latter being the conclusion.

There is a gap between the data obtained by the researchers from previous studies and the current study where there are differences in component data. Previous research used the argumentative essay component according to Hyland (2018) where there are three main components: thesis, argument and conclusion. Components that have been quoted from Rolls and Wignell in Darwin (2015) And also supported by theories from Sopiah (2022), Marshall in Chang (2021), Erduran (2004) and Dang (2020). Based on the theories above, this research used six components, they are attention getter, thesis statement, pro argument paragraph, counter argument paragraph, rebuttal and conclusion.

METHOD

In this research, researchers used descriptive qualitative methods which applied content analysis. Gay (2012:7) defines qualitative research as the collection, analysis, and interpretation of coherent narrative and visual data, non-numerical) data to learn more about a particular interesting phenomenon. The data of the research were argumentative essay documents written by fourth semester students in the midterm project of argumentative writing course. Researchers made a table of argumentative writing components to better understand when analyzing documents.

To analyze the data, the researchers analyzed documents based the components of argumentative writing, they underlined student documents and wrote code for each the components that have been obtained in the student documents. Each finding about the argumentative writing component grouped into the table with the code given. The last is interpret the finding by drawing conclusions from the patterns and themes identified. Then the researcher validate the analysis by ensure reliability and validity by checking for consistency and seeking feedback. Finally, report the results by presented the findings in a structured manner, using qualitative data.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Findings

The researchers has created a grouping table after analyzing the six components of argumentative writing. The purpose of the researcher has made table analysis to get information about which components have been applied and which have not been applied by students in argumentative writing. The following is a description of the data about students argumentative essay components:

Attention Greater

Attention getter is essential to get perusers intrigued to an exposition the author compose. It is the principal sentence in an early on section of an exposition. In order for a writer to effectively convey their concepts to the reader, they must entice them. (Sopiah 2022).

Table 1: Attention Getter

Name of Documents	Attention Getter
d1	A famous American Novelist, George R.R Martin, said, "A reader before he dies.
d2	The internet has emerged as one of the most transformative inventions of the 20th century, reshaping human society on a global scale.
d3	Is the death penalty effective ? The death penalty is the most cruel punishment, and the death penalty is not the solution.
d4	At this time, the development of communication is indeed increasingly sophisticated. A question mark why everyone should have internet acces?
d5	Traffic accidents are something that often happens and may have been experienced by some people, the cause of traffic accidents is influenced by several factors such as the negligence of the drivers, both intentional and unintennational.

From five samples that have been obtained research finds sentences that can be described belows:

"A famous American Novelist, George R.R Martin, said, "A reader before he dies." This is one example of an attention getter where the author of the argumentative describes a famous writer. The sentence attracted the attention of the reader to deepen the curiosity about the character of the author.

All students have implemented this component, automatically understood getter in accordance with the theory. Students make attention getters with various versions, some with

questions at the beginning and some in the form of fact that can attract readers to read their writing.

Thesis Statement

The thesis statement in an introduction can be a single sentence or a series of sentences. It can come before or after the essay's organizational structure. The writer's opinion is made clear to the reader right away in the thesis statement, but the reader still needs to read on to learn more (Marshall in Chang 2021)

Table 2: Thesis Statement

Name of Documents	Thesis Statement
d1	On the other hand, now, there is a controversial issue about which one is better between reading conventional or printed books and reading ebooks. The development of technology today makes everyone read and bring books easily because the books already on their devices.
d2	Its impact has been profound, permeating various aspects of our lives and altering the way we communicate, acces information, conduct business, and interact with the world around us.
d3	The issue of the death penalty has been around for a long time and is likely to remain a hot topic among philosophers and legal scientist, even among the people themselves.
d4	Currently, internet acces is owned by all groups, form childreen to adults because internet access is no stranger and it has become an important thing in everyday life.
d5	However, nowadays there are still many people who are reckless and deliberately drive drunk, they are not even afraid of the punishment that will be given. Because they think that I year in prison is not too burdensome.

The researcher took a document from one of the student's papers such as

"On the other hand, now, there is a controversial issue about which one is better between reading conventional or printed books and reading ebooks. The development of technology today makes everyone read and bring books easily because the books already on their devices."

From the data above the sentence contains the main idea which is then developed in the pro and counter sentences in the argumentative essay. Based on the components analyzed by the researchers, it was found that 45 students applied the thesis statement component. They only described five examples of analysis results for thesis statement. To find out more clearly about the analysis of the thesis statement component can be seen in the introduction section ; there are sub-components of conclusion. So that the main components are strong, among others: grabber(G), issue (I), Position (P), reason (R).

Pro Argument paragraph

Rolls & Wignell (2015) said that the writer should back up the thesis statement with evidence like facts, examples, testimony, and definitions from the reading list. Each body passage ought to be a different supporting explanation.

Table 3: Pro Argument Paragraph

Name of Documents	Pro Argument Paragraph
d1	First, reading conventional or printed books leads the reader to have the best focus on their reading. Secondly, books are always connected to successful people.
d2	1. Access to information and knowledge. 2. Communication and connectivity. 3. Economic opportunities. 4. Cultural exchange and diversity.
d3	Let's come to the first reason is, the death penalty violates human rights. Let's come to the second reason is, death penalty is not effective in reducing crime. The last one reason is discriminatory against those who come from poor families.
d4	The first reason is to encourage economic growth, internet connection has indeed become an important role for business people, especially online business. The second is learning becomes easier. The last is speed up work, most jobs do require an internet connection.
d5	First, reducing traffic accidents. Second, reduce the loss of public facilities on the road.

The researchers took documents from one of the student's papers such as:

“The first reason is to encourage economic growth, internet connection has indeed become an important role for business people, especially online business. The second is learning becomes easier. The last is speed up work, most jobs do require an internet connection.”

The sentence above is one of the examples of pro argument because there are several reasons that reinforce the main statement of a topic being discussed. There are sub-components to understand the main components of pro argument paragraphs including: reason (R), factor (F), explain (E), and transition (T). The finding shows that 45 students have applied pro argument components.

Counter Argument Paragraph

Counter argument paragraph according Rolls and Wignell in Darwin(2015) to acknowledge the other side of the argument and then respond to the opposite claim as many students did not understand with counter argument component. They did not know how to write it well.

Table 4: Counter Argument Paragraph

Names of Documents	Counter Argument Paragraph
d1	Even though many people think that reading Ebooks is easier than reading conventional or printed books because it is easy to get and read them on devices such as smartphone, laptop, tablets, etc.
d2	Critics argue that the negative consequences of the internet, such as privacy concerns and spread of misinformation, cannot be ignored.
d3	But in another research by Batubara (2019) provide a different effect, the death penalty is appropriate given to criminals who are sadistic so that the action does not happen again.
d4	-
d5	-

The researcher took from one of the student's paper, it can seen below:

“Critics argue that the negative consequences of the internet, such as privacy concerns and spread of misinformation, cannot be ignored.”

Strengthening the form of objection to the arguments discussed. There are sub-components to understand the main components of counter argument paragraphs including: opposing claim (OC), support (S), transition support(TS) support

Rebuttal

Rebuttals include attacks on the grounds of a claim or attacks directly on a claim (e.g., highlighting a portion of a claim that is invalid (Erduran, 2004). A rebuttal is a refutation of a counter argument paragraph. Based on data analysis, there are only 13 students who have applied the rebuttal in their argumentative essay.

Table 5: Rebuttal

Name of Document	Rebuttal
d1	Jeon (2010) said that reading on devices or electronic books decreases reading comprehension . Reading Ebooks is also not good for eyes. Reading books will take a long time, and

	seeing the screen for a long time is not good for the eyes. One of the impact is eye fatigue. Jeong (2010) also said that reading the electronic books causes fatigue. Eye fatigue can cause concentration issues, headaches and double vision. So, reading Ebooks is not good for reader.
d3	Actually the above argument is good, but I don't agree with that. According to Putri and Sugiyono (2011) stated that the death penalty does not have a deterrent effect or reduce crime rates, especially for narcotics crimes, murders and so on. For example, the proof is that until now there are still many crimes mentioned above running around, almost touching all aspects of people's lives. Evil is in our environment every day. Even crime always threatens us, the environment still doesn't feel safe, even though the death penalty is in our country, but still, it still raises concerns for the public.
d6	Behind the permissibility of abortion in the medical world, abortion is still an act that is prohibited in Indonesia and is prohibited by law but there are also many people who have abortions.
d8	While it is crucial to foster children's independence and encourage exploration, it should be done within the bounds of responsible guidance.
d10	While personal freedom is important, it should not come at the expense of public health and the well-being of others. The negative externalities of smoking, such as secondhand smoke, affect non-smokers who have not made the choice to engage in such behaviour. Banning smoking in public spaces strikes a balance between personal freedom and protecting and right of other.

The theory explains how the position of the rebuttal. From data analysis above it has been found that many students did not understand the position of a rebuttal in their writing.

Conclusion

Conclusion in the essay is as important as writing the introduction. It helps readers summarize the writer's point of view and understand the issue the writer is arguing. It usually restates the thesis statement, summarizes the main and order to offer the best solution (Dang, 2020)

Table 6: Conclusion

Name of Documents	Conclusion
d1	In conclusion, reading conventional or printed books is better than reading Ebooks because at least two reasons. The first is it will lead the readers to have the best focus on concentration on reading and the second is reading printed books leads the readers to be a successful person in the future. So, read more books and less the devices consumption. If you want to be develop, read more books. Barack Obama said, " if you know how to read, then the whole world opens up to you"
d2	The internet has transformed human society in remarkable ways,

	<p>revolutionizing the way we communicate, access information, conduct business, and interact with the world. Its influence has been overwhelmingly positive, enhancing education, fostering global connectivity, creating economic opportunities, and promoting cultural exchange. As we continue to harness the power of the internet, it is crucial to address its challenges while capitalizing on its immense potential to shape a more inclusive, knowledgeable, and interconnected world.</p>
d3	<p>In conclusion the death penalty violating human right, not effective in reducing the crime, and death penalty can be a form of discrimination against people belonging to poor families, here are some reasons why giving death penalty to perpetrators of crimes is not an effective way to do it. And there is also no real evidence that the death penalty can have a deterrent effect or be effective in reducing crime, because until now the crimes still occur everywhere. "There is no justice in killing in the name of justice.</p>
d4	<p>In summary, there are so many benefits when we have good internet access, therefore it is mandatory for everyone to have internet access so that everything can be easier in their daily activities. If everyone uses the internet properly, they will get more positive and profitable things for them.</p>
d5	<p>In conclusion, we cannot avoid traffic accidents, in fact, this can happen at any time, be it policy or accidental, but we should reduce traffic accidents by applying very strict rules that can have a very extraordinary deterrent effect on perpetrators who drive drunk, because it can reduce traffic accidents and reduce the loss of public facilities on the road. Always remember that for the sake of pleasure it can harm other people's lives so drive in good condition and avoid driving drunk.</p>

The researcher took from one of the student's document, to show the conclusion component such as:

"In conclusion, reading conventional or printed books is better than reading Ebooks because at least two reasons. The first is it will lead the readers to have the best focus on concentration on reading and the second is reading printed books leads the readers to be a successful person in the future. So, read more books and less the devices consumption. If you want to be develop, read more books. Barack Obama said, " if you know how to read, then the whole world opens up to you."

In the sentence of an idea reached at the end of the conversation, there is the word "in conclusion" which is a sign that the phrase is a conclusion. Based on the findings of the researcher, there are 41 students who have applied these components. Conclusion contained in the last paragraph that takes the essence of the reading that has been discussed previously. Students have applied it well proved by many who have applied.

Discussion

There are six components of argumentative writing. Researchers analyzed 45 documents of students from the fourth semester of the English Department of UIN Mahmud Yunus Batusangkar and found a variety of student variations in applying the argumentative writing components. Many students have fully implemented these components, while some did not apply all of them.

The attention getter or grabber is essential to get readers intrigued by the essay the author composes. It is the principal sentence in an introductory section of an exposition. In order for a writer to effectively convey their concepts to the reader, they must entice them (Sopiah 2022). All students have applied these components, automatically understanding the attention getter in accordance with the theory. Students create attention getters with various versions, some with questions at the beginning and some in the form of facts that are able to attract readers to their writing. The thesis statement was also applied by all students, in line with Marshall's theory as cited by Chang, where this statement can be a single sentence or a series of sentences clearly presenting the writer's opinion.

The pro argument paragraph, which according to Rolls & Wignell in Darwin (2015) should be supported by evidence such as facts, examples, and definitions, was applied by all students. This component includes sub-components of reason, fact, explanation, and transition. However, the application of counter argument and rebuttal showed variation. Only 29 students applied the counter argument, which Rolls & Wignell (2015) emphasize as important for acknowledging the other side of the argument. Even fewer, only 13 students, applied the rebuttal, which Erduran (2004) describes as involving attacks on the grounds of a claim or directly on the claim itself.

The conclusion component was applied by 41 out of 45 students. Dang (2020) stresses the importance of the conclusion in summarizing the writer's viewpoint and offering the best solution. This component includes sub-components such as issue, position, reason, and alternative solutions. These findings align with Rolls & Wignell's theory in Darwin (2015), which outlines six main components and sixteen supporting components of argumentative writing.

This analysis of argumentative components was based on the lesson plan taught by the lecturer of the argumentative writing course in semester IV. Each main component has sub-components, such as grabber, issue, position, and reason in the introduction; reason, fact, explanation, and transition in pro argumentative paragraphs; opposing claim, opposing

support, transition, and support transition in counter argument paragraphs; and issue, positions, reasons, and alternative solutions in the conclusion.

The research findings demonstrate that while students generally understand and apply basic components like the attention getter, thesis statement, and pro argument paragraph, they struggle more with advanced elements such as counter arguments and rebuttals. This suggests a need for more focused instruction on these complex aspects of argumentative writing to enhance students' overall proficiency in crafting argumentative essays.

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

Based on the research findings and discussion, we can draw several important conclusions regarding the argumentative writing skills of the 45 students analyzed. All students demonstrated proficiency in crafting attention getters, thesis statements, and pro argument paragraphs in their argumentative essays, indicating a solid grasp of these fundamental components. However, the application of more advanced elements showed varying levels of understanding. While 29 students successfully incorporated counter arguments, only 13 were able to effectively write rebuttals, suggesting a significant area for improvement. The conclusion component was well-handled by 41 students, with just four failing to apply it properly. These findings highlight the need for targeted improvement in specific areas of argumentative writing. Particularly, students require additional support and instruction in developing counter arguments and crafting effective rebuttals. To address these gaps, it is recommended that the argumentative writing lecturer place greater emphasis on these components in their curriculum. Focused exercises, examples, and practice sessions dedicated to counter arguments and rebuttals could significantly enhance students' overall argumentative writing skills. Additionally, while the conclusion component was generally well-executed, there is still room for improvement to ensure all students can consistently apply this crucial element. By concentrating on these areas, the course can help students develop more comprehensive and persuasive argumentative essays, better preparing them for academic and professional writing challenges.

REFERENCES

- Al-Haq, F. A. A., & Ahmed, A. S. (1994). Discourse problems in argumentative writing. *World Englishes*, 13(3), 307-323.
- Braine, G., & Caire, M. (1996). *Writing from sources: A guide for ESL students*. California: Mayfield.

- Brown, H. D. (2001). *Teaching by principles: An interactive approach to language pedagogy*. San Francisco: Longman.
- Chala, P. A., & Chapetón, C. M. (2012). EFL argumentative essay writing as a situated-social practice: A review of concepts. *Folios*, 36, 23-36.
- Chase, B. J. (2011). An analysis of the argumentative writing skills of academically underprepared college students.
- Daly, M. E. (1994). \$52.00; Donal A. Kerr, 'A Nation of Beggars'? Priests, People and Politics in Famine Ireland. In Heathcliff and the Great Hunger: Studies in Irish Culture (Vol. 69). Declan Kiberd. Retrieved from <http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/t-and-c>
- Darwin. (2015). *Academic essay writing*. New York: University Press.
- Elbow, P. (1973). *Writing without teachers*. London: Oxford University Press.
- Erduran, S. (2022). *Argumentation in chemistry education: Research, policy and practice*. Royal Society of Chemistry.
- Ferretti, R. P., & Graham, S. (2019). Argumentative writing: Theory, assessment, and instruction. *Reading and Writing*, 32(6), 1345–1357. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11145-019-09950-x>
- Gay, L., Mills, G. E., & Airasian, P. (2012). *Educational research: Competencies for analysis and applications*.
- Harahap, N. (2002). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*.
- Harmer, J. (2004). *How to teach writing*. England: Pearson Education.
- Hyland, K. (1990). *RELC Journal*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/003368829002100105>
- Keraf, G. (2004). *Narasi dan argumentasi*. Jakarta: PT. Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Meyers, A. (2005). *Gateway to academic writing: Effective sentence paragraph, and essay*. New York: Pearson Education Inc.
- Oshima, A., & Hogue, A. (1999). *Writing academic English* (3rd ed.). United States of America: Addison Wesley Publishing Company.
- Soles, D. (2010). *The essentials of academic writing* (2nd ed.). Boston: Wadsworth.
- Sopiah, S. (2022). Hook identification of students' essay at EFL classroom. *Jurnal Sastra Studi Ilmiah Sastra Universitas Nasional Pasim*, 12(2).
- Zemach, D. E., & Rumisek, L. A. (2005). *Academic writing: From paragraph to essay*. New York: MacMillan Publishing Company.